The Correlation Analysis of Islamic Education (PAI) Learning Outcomes with Religious Tolerance at Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia (UPI)

Hasan Albana*, Abas Asyafah, Munawar Rahmat
Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Indonesia.
Email*: albana@student.upi.edu

Abstract

This study is motivated by the rampant cases and the spread of intolerant and radical understanding. The cases of intolerance and radicalization even occur to students who should possess a tolerant religious understanding and not get caught up in the indoctrination of religious violence. This study aims to analyze the correlation between PAI learning outcomes and religious tolerance. It applies a causal design and quantitative approach with survey method. The population of UPI Bumi Siliwangi is 24.340 students. The data is collected by utilizing probality sampling technique (cluster sampling). There are 344 respondents and questionnaires are served as the research instrument. Then, the data is analyzed by using descriptive and inferential analysis with the assistance of SPSS. The results of this study indicate that the learning outcomes of UPI students mostly get A is at the level of 45,9%. Religious tolerance of UPI students is generally at the most tolerant level of 61,63%. Tolerance to other religions is highest at the tolerant level of 60,17. Tolerance to the same religion but with different understanding, in this case is minority mazhab, is mostly tend to be intolerant level of 47,67%. Tolerance to the state and government, is mostly at the tolerant level of 38,66%. This study finds that there is no significant correlation between PAI learning outcomes and religious tolerance among the UPI students.

Keywords: Learning Outcomes, PAI, Religious Tolerance.

A. Introduction

Indonesia is a plural country that consists of variety of ethnics, religions, races, culture, and languages. By looking at the religious side, there are at least some acknowledged religions in Indonesia, namely Islam, Catholicism, Protestantism, Hinduism, Confucian, and Buddhism. In 2010, based on the survey conducted by Indonesian Central Bureau of Statistics, Indonesia's population is approximately 236 million people, with 87,18% of them are Islam, 6,96% are Christian, 2,91% are Catholic, 1,69% Hindu, 0,42% Buddhist, and 0,04% are Confucian.[1] The data shows that Muslims are the majority people in Indonesia that can be regarded as the people who are most responsible for the integrity and plurality of Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia (NKRI).

Muslims in Indonesia have many Islamic organizations. There are at least three largest Islamic organizations in Indonesia, namely *Nahdhatul Ulama* (NU), *Muhammadiyah*, and FPI. As written in *kompas.com*, that the top three unforgettable Islamic organizations by the community are NU by 69,3%, followed by Muhammadiyah by 14,5%, and FPI by 9%. These three organizations surely have differences besides the fact that all of them are Islamic organizations[2]. NU has the image as a traditionalist and contextualist organization. Muhammadiyah is a modernist and contextual organization. Meanwhile, FPI is a textualist organization[3].

There are also at least three major Islamic *madzhab* in Indonesia namely *Sunni*, *Syiah*, and *Wahabi*. Their thought differs in understanding Islam, for example the pillars of *Sunni* Islam are different from *Syiah*. According to the *Sunni*, there are five pillars of Islam namely shahada, prayer, zakat, fasting, and hajj. Meanwhile, according to *Syiah*, the pillars of Islam are prayer, fasting, zakat, hajj,

---

[1] Badan Pusat Statistik, *Kewarganegaraan Dan Bahasa Sehari-Hari Penduduk Indonesia* (Jakarta: Badan Pusat Statistik, 2011).

[2] Febrian Januariu Kuwando, 'Survei NU, Muhammadiyah, Dan FPI Tiga Besar "Top of Mind" Organisasi Islam Di Indonesia', *Kompas.Com*, 2017 https://nasional.kompas.com/read/2017/01/30/20222171/survei.nu.muhammadiyah.dan.fpi.tiga.besar.top.of.mind.organisasi.islam.di.indonesia.

[3] Hasanuddin Ali, 'Peta Citrra Ormas Islam Di Indonesia', *Alvara:Beyond Insight*, 2017 http://alvara-strategic.com/peta-citra-ormas-islam-indonesia/ [accessed 28 May 2018].

and al-wilayah.[4] Then, the Wahabism is different from Sunni and Syiah, where they tend to be exclusive and reject Islamic tradition in Indonesia such as Tahlil.[5]

Then, there are also Islamic groups that are against Pancasila and the government. They want to change Pancasila, as the ideology, and change the government system as well into khilafah. Zulkifli Hasan stated in liputan6.com that the government should review more community organizations other than Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia (HTI) which is considered as anti-Pancasila.[6]

Considering the differences that exist in Indonesia, especially the differences between; 1) one religion and another; 2) internal religious understanding in the religion itself, especially in Islam which is the majority of people in Indonesia; and 3) the perspective of religious organizations towards the state and government of Indonesia. Religious tolerance is needed in the sense that the willingness of religious people to live side by side including with other religions, same religions with different understanding, and the state and government. The reason is that without the toleration, these differences can lead to friction among the Indonesian citizens and raise the potential to threaten the integrity of NKRI. According to Osman, religious tolerance is important because every religious group is prone to be a threatening sectarian and communal. Each sectarian or communal can be an exclusive group so that it feels the most righteous group.[7]

The intolerant threat has emerged lately, from understanding to radical actions and terrorist. Based on a survey conducted by the Wahid Foundation shows that out of a total of 1.520 Muslim respondents spread across 34 provinces, 59,9% of them hate certain groups. The hated groups include those from non-Muslim, Chinese,

---

[4] Itmam, "Pemikiran Islam Dalam Perspektif Sunni Dan Syiah," *Jurnal Penelitian*, vol. 7, no. 2 (2006), p. 336.

[5] Aswar, "Politik Luar Negeri Arab Saudi Dan Ajaran Salafi-Wahabi Di Indonesia." *Jisiera: The Journal of Islamic Studies and International Relations,* vol. 1 (2016), p. 20

[6] liputan6.com, "Ketua MPR: Tak Hanya HTI, Ormas Anti Pancasila Lain Perlu Dikaji." *liputan6.com* (11 Mei 2017), http://news.liputan6.com/read/2947621/ketua-mpr-tak-hanya-hti-ormas-anti-pancasila-lain-perlu-dikaji, accessed 28 Mei 2017

[7] Mohamed Fathi Osman, *Islam, Pluralisme, Dan Toleransi Keagamaan*, trans. by Irfan Abubakar (Jakarta: Democracy Project, 2012), p. xxviii.

and communist backgrounds. Out of those 59,9%, 92,2% are disagree if the members of the group they hate become government officials in Indonesia.[8]

In addition, other research mentions that there is a high potential of both radical movement and terrorism in West Java in 2012 until 2016.[9] Then, based on a survey conducted by the Center for Islamic Studies and Society (PPIM) UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta in 2017, more than half of its respondents, both students and college students have intolerant opinions towards minority religious groups as well as tend to be easily influenced by radical religious ideas. These conditions indicate that the influence of intolerance and radicalism spread across many schools and universities in Indonesia.[10]

One of the campuses that attract many prospective students is the campus of UPI. In the academic year of 2017-2018, UPI is demanded by 44.132 prospective students.[11] It is also classified as the campus with a large number of students in Indonesia based on data from the Directorate of Student Affairs. The students at Bumi Siliwangi campus are 24.340 students. UPI, which in fact also produces educators in Indonesia, plays a big role in advancing education in Indonesia. It has a scientific, educational, and religious campus motto. Therefore, the act of tolerance should be owned by all of the students.

Then, recently there was rioting in Mako Brimob between terrorist prisoners and the police officers. In the riots, police officers arrested two women suspected of terrorism that made up for the ISIS.

---

[8] Rakhmat Nur Hakim, 'Survei Wahid Foundation: Indonesia Masih Rawan Intoleransi Dan Radikalisme', *Republika.Co.Id*, 2017 http://www.republika.co.id/berita/pendidikan/dunia-kampus/17/05/30/oqrxve384-kampus-perlu-deteksi-dini-gejala-radikalisme-dan-intoleransi [accessed 26 July 2017].

[9] Ayi Sofyan and Gustiana Isya Marjani, *Implementasi Kebijakan Pencegahan Radikal Terorisme Di Provinsi Jawa Barat* (Bandung: UIN SGD, 2016).

[10] Terry Muthahhari, 'Survei UIN Jakarta: Intoleransi Tumbuh Di Banyak Sekolah Dan Kampus', *Tirto.Id*, 2017 https://tirto.id/survei-uin-jakarta-intoleransi-tumbuh-di-banyak-sekolah-dan-kampus-czQL [accessed 15 May 2018].

[11] Argia Fadillah, 'Info Grafis Peminat UPI 2017', *IsolaPos.Com*, 2018 https://isolapos.com/2017/08/infografis-peminat-upi-2017/ [accessed 31 January 2018].

The two want to help terrorist prisoners to fight against the police officers. One of the two people turned out to be UPI student.[12]

Thus, it is a reasonable question to ask to what extent the toleration owned by the current UPI students towards inter-religious, internal religious and state and government? To what extent does the PAI course at UPI provide a basis for religious tolerance? This question is very important to answer, considering the relationship between religious, internal, and state and government is a requirement for the creation of social integration. According to Imam Suprayogo, three religious harmonies include the internal harmony of religious communities, inter-religious harmony, and harmony between religious communities with the government.[13] By understanding these figures, it is hoped that a sufficient perspective will be presented in efforts towards a better religious, national and state life, and securing religious tolerance through PAI courses, especially among the UPI students.

B. Method

This study employs correlation design and quantitative approach with survey method. The population for this study is the Muslim students of UPI Bumi Siliwangi who had succeeded in PAI course. According to the data given from The Directorate of Students Affair, UPI Bumi Siliwangi has 24.430 students. The sampling technique utilized in this research is probability sampling with the type of cluster sampling. The total amount of sample in this study is based on the table of sample determiner, which is 24.430, with the level of error 5% is 344.[14]. This study takes every faculty as its sample and determines the department randomly. Thus, the distribution of the respondents is as follow:

---

[12] Kumparan, 'Identitas Duo Siska, Terduga Pelaku Teror Yang Berbaiat Ke ISIS', *Kumparan*, 2018 https://kumparan.com/kumparannews/identitas-duo-siska-terduga-teroris-yang-berbaiat-ke-isis [accessed 15 May 2018].

[13] Artis, 'Kerukunan Dan Toleransi Antar Umat Beragama', *Toleransi: Media Ilmiah Komunikasi Umat Beragama*, 3.1 (2011), 86–97 (p. 91).

[14] Sugiyono, *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, Dan Kombinasi* (Bandung: Alfabeta, 2015), p. 131.

Table 1. The distribution of respondents.

Faculty	Department	Number of Sample
FIP (Faculty of Education)	Special Education	48
FPIPS (Faculty of Social Education)	History Education	60
FPBS (Faculty of Language and Literature)	English Education	46
FPMIPA (Faculty of Math and Science Education)	Biology Education	43
FPTK (Faculty of Engineering and Vocational Education)	Civil Engineering Education	52
FPOK (Faculty of Sports and Health Education)	Sports Coaching Education	35
FPEB (Faculty of Economic and Business Education)	Management	42
FPSD (Faculty of Art and Design Education)	Fine Art Education	18
Total		344

The instrument that utilized in this study is questionnaire. The content validity and constructive validity of the questionnaire had been examined by conducting a trial to 89 students and asking the professionals' opinions. The professionals consist of Prof. Endis Firdaus, M.Ag., Dr. Wawan Hermawan, M.Ag., and Dr. Fahrudin, M.Ag. The results of the trial reveal that items that are going be used to collect the data are valid. In addition, according to those professionals the items can be used to collect the data with revision or notes. Reliability testing is conducted by the splithalf technique from Spearman and Brown with the help of IBM SPSS 21. The results are the alpha score is 0,0832 bigger from r table with N=89, significant 5% is 0,213 and significant 1% is 0,278. Thus, the instrument is reliable. The outline of the components from the valid and reliable questionnaire is as follow.

Table 2. The outline of religious tolerance.

Variable	Component	Indicator	Number of Instrument		Total
			Positive	Negative	
Religious Tolerance	Toleration towards Other Religions	Honoring Other Religions	34, 8	1, 12	4
		Acceptance of Members from Other Religions	20, 22	4, 14	4
		Acceptance of Other Religious's Place of Worship	21, 31	23	3
		Honoring the Feast of Other Religions	5, 46	15, 28	4
	Toleration toward the Same Religious People but with Different Understanding	Acceptance of the Presence of Other *Madzhab*	43	7, 40	3
		Acceptance of the Institutions of Other *Madzhab*	41, 29	13, 47	4
		Honoring Religious Leaders from Other *Madzhab*	3, 36	17, 26	4
		Honoring the Great Day of Other *Madzhab*	37	30	2
	Toleration towards the State and Government	Acceptance of Pancasila, UUD (Constitution), NKRI, and Bhineka Tunggal Ika	42	6, 24	3
		Unquestioning Obedience to the Policies of the Government of Indonesia	16, 48	35, 45	4
		Acceptance of the Other Religions Member in the position of Government	18, 27	33, 11	4
		Willing to be Honest and Fair Witness Despite Putting His Own Religion Members in Adversity	44	39	2

The data analysis of this study employs descriptive analysis and inferential analysis. The descriptive analysis is employed to count the average and median of PAI learning outcomes and UPI students' religious tolerance. While inferential analysis is employed to answer the hypothesis proposed with Spearman correlation since the types of both data presented in this study are ordinal correlated. The hypotheses proposed in this study are as follows.

1. H_0: There is no correlation between PAI learning outcomes and religious tolerance of UPI students.
2. H_1: There is a correlation between PAI learning outcomes and religious tolerance of UPI students.

C. PAI Learning Outcomes in UPI

Firstly, outcome in KBBI means; 1. Something that comes after the effort; 2. Income, acquistion, fruitful; 3. Effect, result, 4. Tax, rent of land, and; 5. Sucess, get the result, not fail.[15] The definition of outcome related to the discussion of learning outcomes is something that comes after the effort and gets the result. While learning is a process to gain knowledge, increase skills, improve attitudes, behavior and strengthen personality.[16]

On the other hand, according to Aritonang, learning is a process of make an effort conducted by individuals to get the change of new behavior as the experience of the individuals themselves.[17] It shows that learning is an effort and the result is behavioral change derived from the experience.

Thus, learning is a process conducted by individuals to get new experience from their surroundings, including knowledge, behavior, and skills that will increase the individuals' capabilities.

Secondly, learning outcomes are students' abilities after their learning experience.[18] This definition focuses on stduents' abilities as

---

[15] 'Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia Pusat Bahaa', ed. by Tim Redaksi KBBI (Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2008), p. 486.

[16] Hariyanto Suyono, *Belajar Dan Pembelajara* (Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya, 2012), p. 9.

[17] K. T. Aritonang, 'Minat Dan Motivasi Dalam Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar Siswa', *Jurnal Pendidikan Penabur*, 7.10 (2008), 11–21 (p. 13).

[18] Nana Sudjana, *Penilaian Hasil Proses Belajar Mengajar* (Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya, 1995), p. 22.

a result of learning experience. On a similar note, according to Winkel, learning outcomes are the product of stduents' learning. The product means the learning objectives. There must be learning objectives so that the learnig product becomes measurable.[19]

Islamic education (PAI), is a compulsory course and taken by Muslim students in every university. As stated in the constitution (UU) no.12 of 2012 about higher education article 35 paragraphs 3, higher education must organize religion, Pancasila, civic and Bahasa Indonesia courses.

Thirdly, The Government Regulation (PP) no.55 of 2007 about Religious Education and Religious Education article 2 paragraph 1, states that religious education serves to "form a faithful and pious Indonesian human being to The Almighty God and provide great morality and able to maintain peace and internal harmony and inter-religious people." It implies that the presence of PAI is important because it is one of the instruments to create virtuous character of university students.

Finally, to support its function, based on Decree of the Director General of Higher Education no.43/DIKTI/Kep/2006 article 4 that the substance of studying PAI courses in the university including the study of Almighty God, and divinity, human beings, law, morals, science, technology, and art, inter-religious harmony, society, culture, and politics.

In relation with PAI learning outcomes the universities, it represents the studnets' academic achievement in PAI course in the universities. In UPI, PAI learning outcomes of the students based on Rector Regulation of UPI No. 5805/UN40/HK/2015 is as follows.

---

[19] W. S. Winkel, *Psikologi Pengajaran* (Jakarta: Grasindo, 1996), p. 483.

Table 3. PAI scores in UPI.

Scoring Category			Degree of Ability
Word	Number	Degree of Quality	
A	4,0	Excellent	92-100
A-	3,7	Almost Excellent or Exceed Expectation	86-91
B+	3,4	Very Good	81-85
B	3,0	Good	76-80
B-	2,7	Fair	71-75
C+	2,4	More Than Sufficient	66-70
C	2,0	Sufficient	60-65
D	1,0	Deficient	55-59
E	1,0	Fail	Less than 55

Based on the results of the study conducted by the researchers, PAI learning outcomes of UPI students will be presented below.

Table 4. PAI learning outcomes of UPI students.

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	A	158	45,9	45,9	45,9
	A-	98	28,5	28,5	74,4
	B+	60	17,4	17,4	91,9
	B	20	5,8	5,8	97,7
	B-	8	2,3	2,3	100,0
	Total	344	100,0	100,0	

It can be seen from the table 4 that the respondents mostly get A in PAI course, which is 158 people (45,9%). Then, 98 people get A- (28,5%), 60 people get B+ (17,4%), 20 people get B (5,8%), and 8 people get B- (2,3%) respectively.

Table 5. The average of PAI learning outcomes.

N	Valid	344
	Missing	0
Mean		1.9012
Median		2.0000
Std. Deviation		1.03389
Minimum		1.00
Maximum		5.00

By looking at the Table 5, the average of PAI learning outcomes of respondents is 1,9 with the category of 1=A, 2=A-, 3=B+, 4=B, dan 5=B-. With this result, the respondents' PAI learning outcomes is in A category.

D. Religious Tolerance

Religious tolerance consists of two words, namely religious which is modified from religion, and tolerance. Tolerance etimologically has an Arabic equivalent of tasamuh which means forgiveness, apology, and relieved.[20] In English, the word tolerance is equivalent to patience, lapang dada, and showing patience.[21] In Greek, tolerance is called *sophrosyne* which means moderation or taking jalan tengah. While in Latin, tolerance roots from tolerantia which means to hold.[22] In the Great Dictionary of Bahasa Indonesia (KBBI), tolerance is an act of being tolerant (loose [respecting, letting, allowing] of different or constrasting stance [statement, perspective, belief, habit, attitude, etc] from oneself.[23]

Religious tolerance illustrates the act of honoring, eradicate discrimination, accommodate, and cooperate among the various religious groups. As stated by Alpizar, religious tolerance portrays

---

[20] Ahmad Warson Munawir, 'Kamus Arab Indonesia Al-Munawir' (Yogyakarta: Balai Pustaka Progresif, Tanpa Tahun), p. 1098.

[21] J. M. Echols and Hasan Shadily, 'Kamus Inggris-Indonesia' (Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2010), p. 595.

[22] Irawan Masduqi, *Berislam Secara Toleran* (Bandung: PT Mizan Pustaka, 2011), p. 7.

[23] Tim Redaksi KBBI, p. 1478.

honor and relieved, without being coercive to oblige one religion and not interfere with other religions.[24]

Religious tolerance also can be interpreted as honoring different statement, giving the same space, and cooperating with the same religious members but with different understading. In Islam it can be seen from the example of Sunni and Syiah that shoud be tolerant towards each other.

The researchers look for the concept of tolerance in the Al-Quran. The results will be elaborated as follows.

1) Tolerance to External Religion

The limitation of being tolerant in Islam is crystal clear, stated in Surah Al-Kafirun verse 6 that to you your religion, and to me my religion. Each and every human has a right to decide and believe in whatever religion believed as the truth and perform its worship. The interference from other groups is not allowed. Muslims must not follow the religious ceremony conducted by the Catholics such a service.

Realizing the freedom to believe in and worship for every religious group means accepting the existence of places of worship and honoring other religious holidays, because every religion has a place as worship and feast as a symbol of their existence. In dealing with the members of other religions, Islam teaches noble character. The following table explains the noble moral taught in Islam related to the interaction with the members of other religions.

Therefore, it can be conclude in accordance with the table 6 above that tolerance with adherents of other religions must not impose them to embrace Islam, respect other believers by not harassing their place of worship, not insulting the Gods of other religions, not interfere with aqidah, conducting a good dialogue with other religions. However, it is permissible to cooperate with other religions' believers and be fair to them. It is important to note that there is no God's intention that humanity is in uniformity.

Table 6. Religious tolerance verses with other religions.

Name of Surah and Verse	Explanation
Al-Baqarah (2) : 256; Yunus (10) : 99	Prohibition against coercion to adhere Islam, because Allah only welcome genuine faith, not the one the coercive one. Everyone has the right to embrace a religion one believes to be true.
Al-Hajj (22) : 40	The honoring of Muslims towards the members of other religions by accepting their places of worship.
Al-An'am (6) : 108	Prohibition against cursing other religious worshipers.
Al-Mumtahanah (60): 8	It is allowed to cooperate, be kind, help, and be fair to the adherents of other religions.
Al-Hujurat (49): 13	The difference exists in order to know each other better instead of creating friction.
Al-Kafirun (109): 6	The acknowledgement of other religions, separation of *aqidah*, and freedom for the adherents of religions.
Saba' (34) : 24-25	Conducting a good dialogue with the adherents of other religions, without boasting to other religions that Islam is absolutely right.
Al-Maidah (5): 2	The freedom of adherent of religions to worship, and the obligation to be fair to everyone.
Hud (11): 118	The relalization that Allah creates plural humanity.

2) Tolerance to Internal Religion with Different Understanding

In the time of Allah's prophet Muhammad SAW, any disagreement can be overcome by asking directly to him. However, there is no more of holy prophet that is used as a justification of an opinion. Al-Quran and hadith serve as benchmark that their interpretations may differ from one another. Tolerance is needed to face those differences.

As already discussed, there are several verses of the Quran that accentuate unity rather than division with either other the same or different adherents of regions. The verses of Al-Quran that emphasize the importance of unity and brotherhood of Muslims are as follows.

Table 7. The tolerance verses with internal religion.

Surah and Verse	Explanation
Al-Hujurat (49): 10	Fellow believers are same as fellow siblings. Insults are prohibited and the unity of ummah should take precedence.
Ali-Imran (3): 103	Firm believe in the religion of Allah and the prohibiton of friction to maintain the unity of ummah.
Hud (11): 118	The realization that Allah creates plural humanity.
At-Taubah	The people who have said syahadat, establish prayers, and pay zakat are fellow brothers or sisters from the same religion.

The explanation that can be derived from table 7 is that fellow Muslims are brothers, although with different understanding but tolerance must be prioritized to keep the unity. In fact, Allah creates variety of humanity in order to get to know each other and maximize the human's potential to be khalifah who served to prosper the earth.

The dispute among Muslims must be resolved in order to preserve the unity of ummah. It can be resolved through dialogue mediated by the third party. As suggested by Madjid that the effort to overcome differences in democratic society prefers a kind of compromise or *islah* among the conflicting parties in the spirit of expressing and hearing opinions and giving and accept.[25]

The Muslims will be strong and the tranquility will come true if they are united, but does not mean to negate the differences because difference is always exist. The way to deal with differences is important. By tolerating the existence of differences can be dealt with honor, wisely and affectionately.

Developing a sense of brotherhood based on mutual respect among Muslims is a manifestation of Islamic teaching about *ukhuwwah*. According to Suryana *ukhuwwah* is a brotherhood related to unity and togetherness among ummah. Togetherness among Muslims is called *ukhuwwah Islamiyyah* or fraternity bound by the

---

[25] Nurcholish Madjid, *Tradisi Islam: Peran dan Fungsinya dalam Pembangunan di Indonesia* (Jakarta: Paramadina, 1997), p. 227

same aqidah.[26] It is in accordance with Al-Ghazali that brotherhood of fellow Muslims is the best way to get closer to God.[27]

3) Tolerance to the State and Government

There is a very close correlation between leadership and concept of state in the perspective of Islam. There is an adage in Islam that read as "no Islam without a group, no gropup without leadership, and no leadership without submission". It is shown clearly in it the importance of a leader or government in Islam. The leader is the supervisor that responsible for the enforcement of Islamic orders and prevention of His prohibition.[28]

Based on the previous explanation of Al-Quran surah An-nisa verse 59 thatv faithful believers are commanded to obey Allah, His prophet, and the government as long as there is no contradiction to Al-Quran and sunnah. If there is a contradicting opinions against the state and government, tolerance is needed to deal with it. Realizing that one of the ways that harmony of religious people can be achieved is through the inter-religion harmony with the government.[29] The government should make policies that accommodate every adherent of religions and they need to obey the state and government as long as there is no contradiction to the religious values and norms.

The religious tolerance data shown in the results of the study is collected by distributing questionnaires to 344 UPI students who succeeded in PAI course. The data is categorized into four categories namely, tolerant (31-41), tend to be tolerant (21-30), tend to be intolerant (11-20), and intolerant (0-10). Religious tolerance of UPI students can be thoroughly illustrated as follows.

---

[26] Toto Suryana, 'Konsep dan Aktualisasi Kerukunan Antar Umat Beragama', Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam-Ta'lim, 9.2 (2011), 127-136 (130)

[27] Al-Ghazali, *Ihya Ulumuddin: Menghidupkan Ilmu-Ilmu Agama* (vol. 1) (Purwanto, Trans.) (Bandung: Marja, 2009) p. 413

[28] Abdurrahman Wahid, *Islamku, Islam Anda Islam Kita: Agama Masyarakat Negara Demokrasi.* (Jakarta: The Wahid Institute) p. 96

[29] Artis, 'Kerukunan Dan Toleransi Antar Umat Beragama', *Toleransi: Media Ilmiah Komunikasi Umat Beragama*, 3.1 (2011), 86–97 (p. 92).

Table 8. Religious tolerance of UPI students.

N	Valid	344
	Missing	0
Mean		28,25
Median		28,00
Mode		28
Std. Deviation		5,497
Minimum		14
Maximum		41

From the table 8 above, it can be reflected that the average of religious tolerance of UPI students is at the score of 28,25, which is in the category of tend to be tolerant. The percentage is elaborated in the following table.

Table 9. Religious tolerance percentage of UPI students.

	Quality	f	%
Religious Tolerance	Tolerant	107	31,11
	Tend to be Tolerant	212	61,63
	Tend to be Intolerant	25	7,26
	Intolerant	0	0
	Total	344	100
	Average	28,25	

From the table 9 above, there are 25 students that are tend to be intolerant (7,3%), 212 students are tend to be tolerant (61,62%), and the rest 107 students are tolerant (31,1%). Thus, most respondents are categorized as tend to be tolerant and then tolerant, and the least is intolerant. The average score of 28,25 is within the category of tend to be tolerant.

An in-depth analysis of religious tolerance covers tolerance towards other religions, tolerance to the same adherents of religions but with different understanding, and tolerance towards the state and government. It will be described in the following table. (Table 10)

Firstly, from the table 10, an insight can be drawn that the qualification of students' religious tolerance towards other religions is 207 respondents (60,17%), tend to be tolerant is 122 respondents (35,46%), and tend to be intolerant is 15 respondents (4,37%). The average tolerance towards other religions is 11,81 out of the maximum score 15. It implies that the average score is within the category of tend to be tolerant. The criteria is determined by the score of 12-15 is within the category of tolerant, 8-11 is tend to be tolerant, 4-7 is tend to be intolerant, and 0-3 is intolerant.

Table 10. Components score of religious tolerance of UPI students.

Components of Tolerance	Quality of Tolerance	Score	
		F	%
Tolerance Towards Other Religions	Tolerant	207	60,17
	Tend to be Tolerant	122	35,46
	Tend to be Intoleran	15	4,37
	Intolerant	0	0
	Total	344	100
	Average Score	11,81	
Tolerance Towards the Same Adherents of Religions but with Different Understanding	Tolerant	43	12,5
	Tend to be Tolerant	125	36,34
	Tend to be Intoleran	164	47,67
	Intolerant	12	3,49
	Total	344	100
	Average Score	7,64	
Tolerance Towards the State and Government	Tolerant	99	28,77
	Tend to be Tolerant	133	38,66
	Tend to be Intoleran	106	30,81
	Intolerant	6	1,74
	Total	344	100
	Average Score	8,80	

Secondly, tolerance towards the same adherents of religions but with different understanding has the qualification of tolerant among the 43 respondents (12,5%), tend to be tolerant is 125 respondents (36,34), tend to be intolerant is 164 respondents (47,67), and intolerant is 12 respondents (3,49%). Most of the respondents are within the category of tend to be tolerant. The average score is 7,64 out of the maximum 13. Thus, the respondents are categorized as tend to be tolerant towards the same adherents of religions but with different understanding with the criteria of 0-3 is intolerant, 4-7 is tend to be intolerant, 8-10 is tend to be tolerant, and 11-13 is tolerant.

Finally, tolerance towards the state and government has the qualification of tolerant among 99 respondents (28,77%), tend to be tolerant is 133 respondents (38,66%), tend to be intolerant is 106 respondents (30,81%), and intolerant is 6 respondents (1,74%). The average of tolerance towards the state and government is 8,80 out of the maximum 13. Thus, UPI students are tend to be tolerant towards the state and government with the criteria 0-3 is intolerant, 4-7 is tend to be intolerant, 8-10 is tend to be intolerant, and 11-13 is tolerant.

It is interesting to notice in the collected data that there are students who tend to have intolerant and even intolerant related to the religion. Ideally, students as intellectuals should be able to preserve the unity of Indonesia by having tolerant perspectives, given the diversity of Indonesian citizen in some ways; one of them is in diversity of religions.

The students are more tolerant to other religions than to those who have the same religion but with different understanding. This result is in accordance with the results of study conducted by the Center for Islamic Studies and Society (PPIM) by UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta in 2017. It states that students and college students are more tolerant to adherents of other religions than to those who differ in perception eventhough they are fellow Muslims. They are more able to accept Christians than Ahmadiyah or Syiah.[30]

---

[30] Agus Yulianto, 'Sikap Siswa Dan Mahasiswa Lebih Toleran Terhadap Non-Muslim', *Republika.Co.Id*, 2017

Similarly, Rahmat elaborates in his study that majority of UPI students have an exclusive religious thinking pattern.[31]

Likewise, in this study, the respondents tend to be intolerant on the items that related to Syiah as in the following statements; there may be a Syiah school in the neighborhood where I live; I forbid my brothers/sisters to enroll in Syiah eduation institution even it is a bonafide one; we respect the opinion of Syiah leader who justify marriage mut'ah despite we forbid it; the Syiah figures or Ijabi leaders are heretic; and there may be a commemoration of Asyura in my neighborhood. The most extreme statement related to Syiah is Syiah and Ahmadiyah have no right to live in Indonesia. Thus, the respondents are considered have not achieved active tolerance towards Syiah, which is tolerance that involving themselves with others in spite of differences and diversity.[32]

Religious views that are intolerant of dissent within their internal religion can be categorized as the indication of exclusivity. The exclusivity within the internal religion means that those who dissent with the rest of the group are heretic.[33] This kind of view is indeed harmful and prone to feuds between internal groups of religion who claim that they are the right one.

History also records the time when Muslims are divided into many groups such as khawarij, mu'tazilah, syiah, and sunni. Those groups are more tolerant to non-Muslims compare to fellow Muslims with different understanding. The story of Washil bin Atha', the founder of Mu'tazilah, told that he were asked whether he were Muslims when he met Khawarij group. He said that he were musyrik *mystajir* (Musyrik who seek for surveillance). He knew that if had he been admitted as mu'tazilah, the group would have treated him abusively. However, if he admitted as being Musyrik, he will be treated well and gently.[34]

---

http://republika.co.id/berita/pendidikan/eduaction/17/11/09/oz4yr1396-sikap-siswa-dan-mahasiswa-lebih-toleran-terhadap-nonmuslim [accessed 11 May 2018].

[31] Munawar Rahmat, 'Corak Berpikir Keagamaan Mahasiswa', *Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 10.1 (2012), 13–37 (p. 25).

[32] Casram, 'Membangun Sikap Toleransi Beragama Dalam Masyarakat Plural', *Wawasan: Jurnal Ilmuah Agama Dan Sosial Budaya*, 1.2 (2016), 187–98 (p. 191).

[33] Komarudin Hidayat, *Menafsirkan Kehendak Tuhan* (Bandung: Mizan, 2003), p. 45.

[34]Biyanto, 'Berdamai Dengan Perbedaan', in *Fikih Kebinekaan* (Bandung: Mizan), p. 267.

According to Munajat, being intolerant can lead to violent act related to one's fundamental of religious understanding. The more fundamentalist someone is the more he/she approves the violence. The fundamentalism is reactive, dualistic thinking, absolute interpretation, apocalyptic views, deep conviction, and selective emphasis.[35]

On a similar note, Azra states that intolerant arises firstly from the understanding and praxis of exclusivity towards religion, sect, or its denomination. Secondly, it arises literal understanding of verses in the scripture. Thirdly, it arises from unfair treatment to the community of other religions.[36] Thus, the development of inclusive understanding is needed, which is a flexible, open, and tolerant Islamic understanding.

Futhermore, the Wasatiyyat Islam needs to be introduced and developed as the basis of Islamic practice which is to be *rahmat li al-'alamin*. As Indonesia's proposal for the High Level Consultation of Muslim Scholars and Intellectuals about Wasatiyyat Islam that reflects *tawasut* (middle)*, tasamuh* (tolerant)*, tawazun* (balance)*, i'tidal* (fair)*,* dan *iqtisad* (simple).[37]

Then, tolerance towards the state and government needs to get attention as well because the quite high value of respondents are tend to be intolerant which is 30,81%, and intolerant which is 1,74%. A study conducted by Rahmat decribes that UPI students have exclusive thinking pattern. One of the characteristics is the view that considers *de facto* government as heretical and kafir because it does not stem from Al-Quran and Sunnah, and does not follow the practice of government ala Rasulullah and *khulafa al-rasyidin*.[38] In this study, there are items that considered as tend to be intolerant, namely khilafah which is part of obligatory Islamic syariat, and is not mandatory to obey the government that does not based on Al-Quran and Sunnah.

---

[35] Munajat, 'Causal Analysis of Religious Violence, a Structural Equation Modeling Approach', *Al-Jami'ah: Journal of Islamic Studies*, 53.2 (2015), 413–37 (p. 413).

[36] Azyumardi Azra, 'Intoleransi Keagamaa', *Universitas Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta*, 2015 http://www.uinjkt.ac.id/id/intoleransi-keagamaan/ [accessed 12 May 2018].

[37] Utusan Khusus Presiden RI, *Wasatiyat Islam: Konsepsi Dan Implementasi* (Bogor: Kantor Utusan Khusus Presiden RI, 2018), p. 10.

[38] Rahmat, p. 25.

Tolerance towards the state and government is one of the requirements for the realization of harmony among the civilians. According to Rusydi, harmony between religious groups and government are to strive for the harmony and conformity among the adherents of religions or the officials by understanding and respecting every effort to develop religious citizens and nation of Indonesia.[39]

The perspective that tends to be intolerant towards the state and government according to the researcher is affected by the roles of Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia (HTI) since it is the most vocal in the reinforcement of khilafah. It is strengthen by Rahmat's statement that Islamic activists in the universities are well known for voicing the slogans such as fight for government model practiced by The Prophet and *khulafa al-rasyidin*, as well as fight for Islamic khalifah.[40]

The attempt to strengthen the religious tolerance perspective according to the researchers is by deeper and proper learning of Islam, not only focus on textual understanding, but also looak at the context. The culture of religious tolerance needs to be developed within the families, communities and universities. In the universities, according to Raihani, a religious lecturer provides an understanding of other religions teaching or the same religion but with different understanding to foster the growth of religious tolerance.[41]

E. The Correlation of PAI Learning Outcomes and Religious Tolerance in UPI

The researchers conduct correlation test to determine the correlation between PAI learning outcomes and religious tolerance by employing Spearman correlation test with the help of *IBM SPSS 21.*

---

[39] Ibnu Rusydi, 'Makna Kerukunan Antar Umat Beragama Dalam Konteks Keislaman Dan Keindonesiaan', *Al-Afkar: Journal for Islamic Studies*, 1.1 (2018), 170–81 (p. 178).

[40] Rahmat, p. 28.

[41] Raihani, 'Creating Culture of Religious Tolerance in an Indonesian School', *South Asia Research*, 4.22 (2014), 541–60 (p. 241).

As stated by Hasan, if the data that will be analyzed are both ordinal data then Spearman correlation test can be done.[42]

Table 11. The correlation between PAI learning outcomes and religious tolerance.

			pai learning outcomes	religious tolerance
Spearman's rho	pai learning outcomes	Correlation Coefficient	1,000	,009
		Sig. (2-tailed)	.	,873
		N	344	344
	religious tolerance	Correlation Coefficient	,009	1,000
		Sig. (2-tailed)	,873	.
		N	344	344

Based on table 11, *correlation coefficiant* score between PAI learning outcomes and religious tolerance is 0,009. It indicates that there is almost no correlation between PAI learning outcomes and religious tolerance. Then, the significance score is $0,873^-$ 0,05. It implies that there is no significant correlation between PAI learning outcomes and religious tolerance. Thus, the first hypothesis H_0 is proved dan H_1 is nullified.

It is interesting to explore that there is almost no correlation PAI learning outcomes and religious tolerance, as well as there is no significance in both of them. Ideally, PAI learning outcomes should provide understanding of religious tolerance and have significant correlation with PAI learning outcomes since it is a strategic course in directing students' moral including religious tolerance.

However, it is normal because PAI scoring system does not cover religious tolerance aspect. Aspects that are taken into consideration in PAI course range from final exam (UAS) score, mid term exam (UTS) score, students' personality, participance in tutorials, attendance, and the ability in reciting Al-Quran. The final exam score is twice bigger in weight than other criteria.

Also, PAI learning contents in UPI have not explicitly teach religious tolerance. The existing materials can be modified in such a

---

[42] Iqbal Hasan, *Analisis Data Dengan Statistika* (Jakarta: PT Bumi Aksara, 2009), p. 45.

way so that they discuss religious tolerance for instance ijtihad materials, worship, mazhab, and Islamic thinking. However, the opportunity that the learning materials are not discussed further still exists because they are not the main focus in the course. Even the final exam questions do not talk about religious tolerance.

Therefore, the researchers suggest that PAI shoud teach religious tolerance explicitly. As the Decree of the Director General of Higher Education of the Ministry of National Education of the Republic Indonesia Number 43/DIKTI/Kep/2006 concerning the Rules of the Implementation of Personality Development Courses Group in Higher Education in religious education, one of which contains the harmony of adherents of religions that refer to religion is God's bless for all human and togetherness in religious plurality.

Learning materials about tolerance towards different opinions or choice and harmony of religious groups are very much needed considering the various race, ethnic, language and religion of Indonesian citizens. As stated by Manuaba, one of the professors of faculty of cultural science Airlangga University Surabaya, that perceptions and tolerance towards differences in Indonesia can be done through tolerance education. The importance of optimal tolerance education is desperately needed so that people can respect and honor each other in the future in the state and nation. We need to create the upcoming generations that are more tolerant towards the inevitability of diversity and differences in this nation.[43]

In accordance with Raihani that states students who are provided with understanding related to the differences by their families, communities, and religious teacher are more tolerant than those who are not provided by tolerance understanding.[44] It implies that a religious teacher or person who teaches religion palys important role in religious tolerance. Indonesia is a diverse nation, and religion diversity is one of the manifestations.

Ferrera explains further that tolerance and religious understanding are two most important objectives that serve as the

---

[43] Putra Manuaba, 'Urgensi Pendidikan Toleransi', *Library UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya*, 2017 http://library.uinsby.ac.id/?p=229Ī [accessed 14 May 2018].

[44] Raihani, p. 541.

basis of religious education. Religious understanding sometimes does not in line with religious tolerance. Many factors affect the individual prior the religious education policy is designed and implemented, besides the thorough examination of religious education. This will lead to a better understanding of individual of the neighborhood.[45]

According to Muliadi, there are several learning materials in order to implement inclusive religious education namely[46]

1. Al-Quran learning materials, not only verses about faith but also verses about understanding and implanting the attitude in interacting with other people who have different religion, different understanding in religious internal or in the state and government. Thus, the understanding that manifested from tolerant attitude is implanted.
2. Morality learning materials, it is important to have moral towards the state and nation besides pious morality to Allah and Rasul Allah, other human beings, and environment in order to create *ukhuwwah wathoniyah* among the diversity of Indonesian.
3. History learning materials which based on history as well as facts and can be   taken from social interaction of The Prophet Muhammad in developing Madinah citizens or his other stories related to religious tolerance.

Thus, the reseracher believe that the given explanation above emphasizes the teaching and understanding of religious tolerance in PAI learning. Since the substance of materials related to the harmony of religious groups is stated in the jurisdiction. Then, people who are taught about tolerance are more tolerant than people who are not. However, sometimes religious tolerance is not in accordance with religious tolerance.

---

[45] Carol Ferrera, 'Religious Tolerance and Understanding in the French Education System', *Religious Education: The Official Journal of Yhe Religious Education Association*, 107.5 (2012), 541–530 (p. 528).

[46] Erlan Muliadi, 'Urgensi Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam Berbasis Multikulturan Di Sekolah', *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 2012, 55–66 (p. 64).

F. Conclusion

PAI in the college/university should be able to give the students a proper understanding of religious tolerance so that the scholars can stop the spread of intolerant understanding. In fact, in some cases there are students that still think about religious exclusivity, intolerant and radical.

Many factors inevitably contribute to someone's attitude towards diversity. They can be family, community, or social media. The results of this study show that eventhough many students get 'A' in PAI course, many of them are tend to be intolerant towards the fellow adherents of religions but with different understanding. In this case is minority madzhab, the state and government. It implies that there is no correlation between PAI learning outcomes and religious tolerance. Thus, according to the researcher the university, as a higher education institute, needs reinforcement to strengthen religious tolerance by providing materials about it explicitly.

For the development of further research about religious tolerance, the upcoming research needs to have different independent variables so that the most powerful factor in affecting religious tolerance can be revealed. The design of tolerance education needs to be made with a quasi experimental research to measure its achievement in improving students' religious tolerance.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Al-Ghazali. (2009). *Ihya Ulumuddin: Menghidupkan Ilmu-Ilmu Agama*. (Vol. 1). (Purwanato. Trans). Bandung: Marja

Ali, Hasanuddin, 'Peta Citrra Ormas Islam Di Indonesia', *Alvara:Beyond Insight*, 2017 http://alvara-strategic.com/peta-citra-ormas-islam-indonesia/ [accessed 28 May 2018]

Alpizar. (2015). 'Toleransi Terhadap Kebebasan Beragama Di Indonesia'.*Toleransi: Media Ilmiah Komunikasi Umat Beragama*, 7, 132–53

Aritonang, K. T. (2008). 'Minat Dan Motivasi Dalam Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar Siswa', *Jurnal Pendidikan Penabur*, 7, 11–21

Artis.(2011). 'Kerukunan Dan Toleransi Antar Umat Beragama'.*Toleransi: Media Ilmiah Komunikasi Umat Beragama*, 3, 86–97

Aswar, Hasbi. (2016). 'Politik Luar Negeri Arab Saudi Dan Ajaran Salafi-Wahabi Di Indonesia'.*Jisiera: The Journal of Islamic Studies and International Relations*, 1, 13–30

Azra, Azyumardi, 'Intoleransi Keagamaa', *Universitas Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta*, 2015 http://www.uinjkt.ac.id/id/intoleransi-keagamaan/ [accessed 12 May 2018]

Badan Pusat Statistik. (2011). *Kewarganegaraan Dan Bahasa Sehari-Hari Penduduk Indonesia*. Jakarta: Badan Pusat Statistik.

Biyanto. 'Berdamai Dengan Perbedaan', in *Fikih Kebinekaan*. Bandung: Mizan

Casram. (2016). 'Membangun Sikap Toleransi Beragama Dalam Masyarakat Plural'.*Wawasan: Jurnal Ilmuah Agama Dan Sosial Budaya*, 1, 187–98

Echols, J. M., and Hasan Shadily. (2010). 'Kamus Inggris-Indonesia'. Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama

Fadillah, Argia, 'Info Grafis Peminat UPI 2017', *IsolaPos.Com*, 2018 https://isolapos.com/2017/08/infografis-peminat-upi-2017/ [accessed 31 January 2018]

Ferrera, Carol. (2012). 'Religious Tolerance and Understanding in the French Education System'.*Religious Education: The Official Journal of Yhe Religious Education Association*, 107, 541–530

Hakim, Rakhmat Nur, 'Survei Wahid Foundation: Indonesia Masih Rawan Intoleransi Dan Radikalisme', *Republika.co.id*, 2017 http://www.republika.co.id/berita/pendidikan/dunia-kampus/17/05/30/oqrxve384-kampus-perlu-deteksi-dini-gejala-radikalisme-dan-intoleransi [accessed 26 July 2017]

Hasan, Iqbal. (2009). *Analisis Data Dengan Statistika*. Jakarta: PT Bumi Aksara

Hidayat, Komarudin. (2003). *Menafsirkan Kehendak Tuhan*. Bandung: Mizan.

Itmam, Muh Shohibul, 'Pemikiran Islam Dalam Perspektif Sunni Dan Syiah', *Jurnal Penelitian*, 7 (2013), 323–40

Kumparan, 'Identitas Duo Siska, Terduga Pelaku Teror Yang Berbaiat Ke ISIS', *Kumparan*, 2018 https://kumparan.com/kumparannews/identitas-duo-siska-terduga-teroris-yang-berbaiat-ke-isis [accessed 15 May 2018]

Kuwando, Febrian Januariu, 'Survei NU, Muhammadiyah, Dan FPI Tiga Besar "Top of Mind" Organisasi Islam Di Indonesia', *Kompas.Com*, 2017 https://nasional.kompas.com/read/2017/01/30/20222171/survei.nu.muhammadiyah.dan.fpi.tiga.besar.top.of.mind.organisasi.islam.di.indonesia

liputan6.com, 'Ketua MPR: Tak Hanya HTI, Ormas Anti Pancasila Lain Perlu Dikaji', *Liputan6.Com*, 2017 http://news.liputan6.com/read/2947621/ketua-mpr-tak-hanya-hti-ormas-anti-pancasila-lain-perlu-dikaji

Madjid, Nurcholish. (1997). *Tradisi Islam: Peran dan Fungsinya dalam Pembangunan di Indonesia*. Jakarta: Paramadina.

Manuaba, Putra. (2017). 'Urgensi Pendidikan Toleransi', *Library UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya*.http://library.uinsby.ac.id/?p=229 [accessed 14 May 2018]

Masduqi, Irawan. (2011). *Berislam Secara Toleran*. Bandung: PT Mizan Pustaka.

Muliadi, Erlan. (2012). 'Urgensi Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam Berbasis Multikulturan Di Sekolah'.*Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 55–66

Munajat. (2015). 'Causal Analysis of Religious Violence, a Structural Equation Modeling Approach'.*Al-Jami'ah: Journal of Islamic Studies*, 53, 413–37

Munawir, Ahmad Warson, 'Kamus Arab Indonesia Al-Munawir' (Yogyakarta: Balai Pustaka Progresif, Tanpa Tahun)

Muthahhari, Terry, 'Survei UIN Jakarta: Intoleransi Tumbuh Di Banyak Sekolah Dan Kampus', *Tirto.Id*, 2017 https://tirto.id/survei-uin-jakarta-intoleransi-tumbuh-di-banyak-sekolah-dan-kampus-czQL [accessed 15 May 2018]

Osman, Mohamed Fathi. (2012). *Islam, Pluralisme, Dan Toleransi Keagamaan*, trans. by Irfan Abubakar. Jakarta: Democracy Project.

Rahmat, Munawar. (2012). 'Corak Berpikir Keagamaan Mahasiswa'.*Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 10, 13–37

Raihani. (2014). 'Creating Culture of Religious Tolerance in an Indonesian School'.*South Asia Research*, 4, 541–60

Rusydi, Ibnu. (2018). 'Makna Kerukunan Antar Umat Beragama Dalam Konteks Keislaman Dan Keindonesiaan'.*Al-Afkar: Journal for Islamic Studies*, 1, 170–81

Sofyan, Ayi, and Gustiana Isya Marjani. (2016). *Implementasi Kebijakan Pencegahan Radikal Terorisme Di Provinsi Jawa Barat*. Bandung: UIN SGD

Sudjana, Nana. (1995). *Penilaian Hasil Proses Belajar Mengajar*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya

Sugiyono. (2015). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, Dan Kombinasi*. Bandung: Alfabeta

Suryana, Toto. (2011). 'Konsep dan Aktualisasi Kerukunan Antar Umat Beragama'. *Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam-Ta'lim*, 2, 127-136

Suyono, Hariyanto. (2012). *Belajar Dan Pembelajara.* Bandung:Remaja Rosdakarya

Tim Redaksi KBBI, ed. (2008). 'Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia Pusat Bahaa'. Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama

Utusan Khusus Presiden RI. (2018). *Wasatiyat Islam: Konsepsi Dan Implementasi.* Bogor: Kantor Utusan Khusus Presiden RI

Wahid, Abdurrahman. (2006). *Islamku Islam Anda Islam Kita: Agama Masyarakat Negara Demokrasi.* Jakarta: The Wahid Institute

Winkel, W. S. (1996). *Psikologi Pengajaran.* Jakarta: Grasindo

Yulianto, Agus, 'Sikap Siswa Dan Mahasiswa Lebih Toleran Terhadap Non-Muslim', *Republika.Co.Id*, 2017 http://republika.co.id/berita/pendidikan/eduaction/17/11/09/oz4 yr1396-sikap-siswa-dan-mahasiswa-lebih-toleran-terhadap-nonmuslim [accessed 11 May 2018]